

Lies OF ANSWERING-ANSAR

1

The Qur'ān, `Umar (ra) and Sodomy with Women:
Exposition of Answering-Ansar's Web of Lies



SUNNI DEFENSE

www.sunnidefense.com

Table of Contents

The Qur'ān, `Umar (ra) and Sodomy with Women: Exposition of Answering-Ansar's Web of Lies.....	4
Mistranslation of " <i>ḥawwaltu raḥliya al-layla</i> " in the Narration	5
Mistranslation of " <i>aqbil wa adbir</i> " ["kabool wa dhabar"].....	5
Distortion by removing " <i>wa ittaqi al-dubura wa al-ḥīḍa</i> " from the Narration.....	7
False Accusation of Dishonesty on the Translator.....	8
False Claim about the Distortion of the Qur'ān	9
Conclusion – The Correct Translation and Understanding of the Incident.....	10
Did Anyone Benefit from this Propaganda?	11
A Bit from the Overflowing Knowledge	11
Works Cited	13

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ


The Qur'ān, `Umar (ra) and Sodomy with Women: Exposition of Answering-Ansar's Web of Lies

The Answering-Ansar team states in their article entitled '*Private lives of the Nasibi Salaf*':

Quoting Answering-Ansar:


According to Ahl'ul Sunnah Umar indulged in sodomy and Allah (swt) was forced to legitimise this practise in the Qur'an

For evidence you can consult the following texts:

1.  **Jami al Tirmidhi, Bab al Tafseer Volume 2, page 382, 'Ayat Hars'**
2. Fathul Bari Volume 8 page 191 Kitab Tafseer Ayat Hars
3. Gharab al Qur'an Volume 3 page 249 Ayat Hars
4. Tafseer al Ibn Katheer Volume 1 page 261
5. Fayl ai Lawathar Volume 6 page 229
6. Tafseer Qurtubi Volume 1 page 92 Ayat Hars

Lets quote verbatim from Jami al Tirmidhi:

"Ibn Abbas narrates that Hadhrath Umar went before Rasulullah (s) and "Master I am destroyed!". Rasulullah (s) asked 'what thing has destroyed you?'. Umar replied last night I had anal sex. Rasulullah (s) did not give a reply to Umar, then Allah (swt) sent down this revelation "Your wives are as a tilth unto you; so approach your tilth when or how ye will; the words 'kabool wa Dhabar' (the anus is accepted)"

 **Jami al Tirmidhi, Bab al Tafseer Volume 2, page 382, 'Ayat Hars'**

Note this is a commentary to Surah al Baqarah, Verse 223 "Your wives are as a tilth unto you; so approach your tilth when or how ye will; the words "kabool wa Dhabar" (the anus is accepted) is nowhere to be found in the Qur'an, but some dishonest Salafi sought to justify his Imam's practice via this additional verse. Interestingly the dishonest Urdu translator fails to translate these tahreef words, even though they are there in the Arabic text, (see the scanned reference from the link above).

So you see Umar's sodomy with his wife is proven from the Saha Sittah of Ahl'ul Sunnah. Umar did this act, made Rasulullah (s) a witness to the deed. The Ulema of Ahl'ul Sunnah should be grateful to Hadhrath Umar, since by sodomising his wife, the Qur'an gave permission for husbands to penetrate their wives in this manner. They owe this all to their great father Umar Farooq.

Private lives of the Nasibi Salaf, page 5-6


The heading of this subchapter clearly shows the approach of Answering-Ansar. Material of this type is highly appreciated in *Shi`i* circles, exciting hormone levels and anti-*Sunnī* sentiments at the same time, as it gives them another reason to malign the majority of the Muslims.

By quoting a narration of *Sunan al-Tirmidhi* about `Umar (ra) and the revelation of the 223rd verse of Sura al-Baqara, the Answering-Ansar team has tried to establish that *Sunnī* texts prove that `Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb (ra) indulged in sodomy and the Qur'ān approved of it.

However, this subchapter tells more about the unreliability and dishonesty of Answering-Ansar, as it is nothing but a poorly constructed web of lies based on the following:

Mistranslation of “*ḥawwaltu rahliya al-layla*” in the Narration

According to the Answering-Ansar team, the “verbatim” translation of the narration in *Sunan al-Tirmidhi* is:

Quoting Answering-Ansar:
Lets quote verbatim from Jami al Tirmidhi:
"Ibn Abbas narrates that Hadhrath Umar went before Rasulullah (s) and "Master I am destroyed!'. Rasulullah (s) asked 'what thing has destroyed you?'. Umar replied last night I had anal sex. Rasulullah (s) did not give a reply to Umar, then Allah (swt) sent down this revelation "Your wives are as a tilth unto you; so approach your tilth when or how ye will; the words 'kabool wa Dhabar' (the anus is accepted)"
 Jami al Tirmidhi, Bab al Tafseer Volume 2, page 382, 'Ayat Hars'
<i>Private lives of the Nasibi Salaf, page 5-6</i>

In this translation, when `Umar (ra) was asked why he claims of being destroyed, he replied “last night I had anal sex.” This is a clear mistranslation of the real words found in the narration. The original text [Arabic] of this narration states that `Umar (ra) said:

حولت رحلي الليلة

ḥawwaltu rahliya al-layla

This short sentence is made of three words. *Ḥawwaltu* [“I turned”] here is a verb that has the subject [`Umar] hidden within it, *rahliya* [“my mount”] is the noun and object in which “mount” is the possession, “my” the possessor [`Umar] and *al-layla* [“tonight”] again is a noun. Together, they should be translated as:

“I turned my mount around tonight.”

This is a known expression among the Arabs that is used to describe sexual intercourse in reverse position—i.e. retrocopulation. Linguists such as Ibn al-Athīr (d. 606), Ibn Manẓūr (d. 711) and al-Zabīdī (d. 1205) have mentioned this explicitly in their works. This is well known among the people of knowledge and is in no need of proof. As it is obvious, there are no words in this sentence that can supposedly be translated as “I had anal sex” and Answering-Ansar has shown untruthfulness by deliberately doing so.

Mistranslation of “*aqbil wa adbir*” [“kabool wa dhabar”]

At the end of the narration, Answering-Ansar ends the verbatim with:

“the words ‘kabool wa Dhabar (the anus is accepted)”

This just places a milestone on the ignorance of the Answering-Ansar team. Only Allāh knows where “the words” came in the translation from. But what tops all is the daft transliteration [“kabool wa Dhabar”] right after it. The real words found in the narration are:

أقبل وأدبر

aqbil wa adbīr

Any Muslim who reads the Holy Qur’ān can easily make out that these words cannot be read as “kabool wa Dhabar.” Astonishingly, the Answering-Ansar team could not even fabricate a proper transliteration for their false translation—despite of the diacritics present on the scan image they have attached!—due to their profound ignorance, because even if the transliteration presented by Answering-Ansar is translated, it would be translated into “acceptance and anus” not “the anus is accepted.” The latter, if translated from Arabic, should have been “*al-duburu maqbūlun*” not “kabool wa Dhabar.”

The real words used in the narration are *aqbil* and *adbīr*, as one can also see from the scan provided by Answering-Ansar. Both of these words cannot, *anyhow*, be translated as “the anus is accepted.” *Aqbil* comes from the root noun of “*iqbāl*” [drawing near] and *adbīr* comes from “*idbār*” [drawing away]. When both of these words are used together, they give a meaning of “back and forth.” This is something simple and does not require any complex Arabic rule to be understood.

The Hans Wehr Dictionary states under “*iqbāl*”:

“*iqbāl* drawing near, advance, approach; coming arrival, advent, turning application, attention, response, responsiveness (to), concern (for), interest (in), demand; good fortune, prosperity welfare | *iqbālan wa idbāran* back and forth, to and from, up and down.”

- *A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic*, of Hans Wehr, page 741 [Beirut]

Both of the words used here are clearly in imperative command, and they should be translated as the following according to the context:

“Approach from the front and back”

These are the words of the Messenger of Allāh (saws) said to `Umar (ra) after the revelation of the verse and it tells that the he (saws) allowed different positions during sexual intercourse—something considered abominable by `Umar (ra) first as mentioned in the narration.

Someone should ask Answering-Ansar though, if *aqbil* and *adbīr* are to be translated as “the anus is accepted,” what do they make of the following narration found in their own texts:

عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال لما خلق الله العقل استنطقه ثم قال له أقبل فأقبل
ثم قال له أدبر فأدبر

“Abū Ja`far (as) said: ‘When Allāh created intelligence, He made it speak and then said to it: ‘Come forward’ [aqbil]. It came forward. He then said to it: ‘Go back’ [adbir]. It went back.’”

- *al-Kāfi*, of Abū Ja`far al-Kulaynī (d. 329), volume 1, page 10 [Tehran]
- *Mir`āt al-`Uqūl fī Sharḥ Akhbār Āl al-Rasūl*, of Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī (d. 1110), volume 1, page 25 [Tehran] – Narration declared rigorously authentic [*ṣaḥīḥ*] by the author.

In the words of al-Ṭabarsī’s *Mishkāt al-Anwār*:

“When Allāh created intelligence, He said to it: ‘Come forward’ [aqbil]. It came forward. He then said to it: ‘Go back’ [adbir]. It went back.’”

- *Mishkāt al-Anwār fī Ghurar al-Akḥbār*, of Abū al-Faḍl al-Ṭabarsī (d. 7th), page 440 [Qum]

Can the Answering-Ansar team tell their readers why they wrongfully translated and transliterated the narration found in *Sunnī* texts?

Distortion by removing “*wa ittaqi al-dubura wa al-ḥīḍa*” from the Narration

So far it has become clear that the narration suggests that `Umar (ra) had sexual intercourse with his spouse in the unordinary reverse position [retrocopulation] and considered it abominable, when he went to the Messenger of Allāh (saws), the verse declaring approaching women ‘however you wish’ was revealed, and the Prophet allowed approaching the wives from the front or the back for sexual intercourse.

The Answering-Ansar team tried hard to mistranslate sentences from the narration to prove their dogma and deceive common Muslims. And to do so, they even went to the extent of removing the part that completely shatters their propaganda. An entire sentence after *aqbil wa adbir* was removed by the Answering-Ansar team in order to save their ark of trickery from drowning.

The narration relates that the Messenger of Allāh (saws) added right after *aqbil wa adbir*:

واتق الدبر والحیضة

wa ittaqi al-dubura wa al-ḥīḍa

“and protect yourself from the anus and menses”

These words explicitly prove that `Umar's (ra) question and the Prophet's (saws) reply discussed earlier did not involve "anal sex" anyhow, because it is impossible that the Prophet (saws) allowed and disallowed sodomy with women in the same breath.

So the whole thing should be correctly translated as:

أقبل وأدبر واتق الدبر والحیضة

“Approach from the front and back, and protect yourself from the anus and menses.”

The fact is that this narration proves the impermissibility of sodomy with women and the scholars of *Ahl al-Sunna wa al-Jamā`a* use this it as an evidence for the impermissibility! The Answering-Ansar team, of course, saw that the last part of the narration would expose their lie, so they chose to tamper with the “verbatim” by completely removing it from the translation.

False Accusation of Dishonesty on the Translator

After mistranslating, mistransliterating and unashamedly tampering with the text, the Answering-Ansar team has the audacity to blatantly lie by accusing the translator of *Sunan al-Tirmidhī* of dishonesty. They say:

Quoting Answering-Ansar:

Note this is a commentary to Surah al Baqarah, Verse 223 "Your wives are as a tilth unto you; so approach your tilth when or how ye will; the words "kabool wa Dhabar" (the anus is accepted) is nowhere to be found in the Qur'an, but some dishonest Salafi sought to justify his Imam's practice via this additional verse. Interestingly the dishonest Urdu translator fails to translate these tahreef words, even though they are there in the Arabic text, (see the scanned reference from the link above).

Private lives of the Nasibi Salaf, page 5-6

Subhān Allāh

The pot calling the kettle black.

The Urdu translator of *Sunan al-Tirmidhī* has translated all the words of the narration, but the Answering-Ansar team accuses him of dishonesty because he correctly translated the narration instead of cramming it with idiotic translations such as “the anus is accepted.”

After translating the narration, he himself adds:

“His statement: ‘I turned my mount around...’ [phayr dī mayñ nay apnī sawārī] Here the wife is meant by the ‘mount,’ as the man takes the wife like a mount during copulation, and the ‘turned’ is that the copulation was done with the front, from the back. In short, `Umar (ra) may have guilt in him, so Allāh (swt) allowed it and the fear was lifted.

His statement: ‘Copulate from the front...’ [sāmnay say *ṣuḥbat kar*] This address, however, (means that) the penetration should be of the front, and then the copulation may be done from any side.”

- *Jā’izat al-Sha`ūdhi Tarjuma Jāmi` al-Tirmidhi* (Urdu), of Badī` al-Zamān, volume 2, page 382 [Karachi]

This clearly explains why the translation should not be as “last night I had anal sex” and “the anus is accepted.”

Perhaps the Answering-Ansar team and their followers should pay some heed before dishonestly accusing others, because the translator has translated the whole narration correctly, and he does not humiliate himself by lying and showing his poor Arabic skills with transliterations such as “kabool wa Dhabar.”

False Claim about the Distortion of the Qur’ān

The last but not the least, Answering-Ansar also states that this narration refers to the distortion of the Holy Qur’ān by referring to parts of it as “tehref words.” This is yet another lie in the long list of lies by the Answering-Ansar team.

There is no conjunction found between the verse and the words of the Messenger of Allāh (saws) to claim the whole thing is a verse and the latter part is not found in the Qur’ān. In addition to that, other versions of the same narration explicitly state that the Messenger of Allāh (saws) himself made the last statement about approaching the wives from back and forth and protecting oneself from sodomy with women and menses.

For reference, please refer to:

1. *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, of Abū `Abd al-Raḥmān al-Nasā’ī (d. 303), volume 5, page 314 [Beirut]
2. *Tafsīr Ibn Abī Ḥātim*, of Ibn Abī Ḥātim (d. 327), volume 2, page 405 [Sidon]
3. *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān bi Tartīb Ibn Balbān*, of Ibn Ḥibbān (d. 354), volume 9, page 516 [Beirut]

It may be hard for the Answering-Ansar team to distinguish this narration from narrations that prove the distortion of the Qur’ān since the *Shī`ī* texts consecutively report such narrations, but there is no doubt that *this* narration has nothing to do with the distortion of the Qur’ān. The Answering-Ansar team deceitfully claims so to save themselves from the fire by blaming the translator of dishonesty and putting this forward as the reason.

Conclusion – The Correct Translation and Understanding of the Incident

The correct translation of this narration should be:

جاء عمر إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال يا رسول الله هلكت قال وما
أهلك قال حولت رحلي الليلة قال فلم يرد عليه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم
شيئا قال فأنزلت على رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم هذه الآية نساؤكم حرث
لكم فأتوا حرثكم أنى شئتم أقبل وأدبر واتق الدبر والحیضة

“Umar came to the Messenger of Allāh (saws) and said: ‘O Messenger of Allāh, I am destroyed!’ He [i.e. Prophet] asked: ‘And what has destroyed you?’ He said: ‘I turned my mount around tonight.’ The Messenger of Allāh (saws) gave him no answer and this verse was revealed to him: ‘*Your women are tillage for you to cultivate. So, come to your tillage from where you wish;*’ Approach from the front and back, and protect yourself from the anus and menses.”

- *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, of Abū `Īsā al-Tirmidhī (d. 279), volume 4, page 284 [Beirut]
- *al-Jāmi` al-Kabīr [Sunan al-Tirmidhī]*, of Abū `Īsā al-Tirmidhī (d. 279), volume 5, page 88 [Beirut]

Note: All other references provided by the Answering-Ansar team are secondary sources that quote *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*.

As evident, this narration opposes the permissibility of sodomy with women, and this is how the *Sunnī* scholars have used this narration throughout history.

But the Answering-Ansar team, in order to achieve their motives, chose to:

1. Mistranslate the words of `Umar (ra) – “I turned my mount around tonight” [*hawwaltu rahliya al-layla*] as “I had anal sex last night.”
2. Mistranslate the words of the Prophet (saws) – “From the front and back” [*aqbil wa adbir*] as “the anus is accepted.”
3. Mistransliterate “*aqbil wa adbir*” as “kabool wa Dhabar” to deceptively support their mistranslation.
4. Tamper with this narration – Snipping “protect yourself from the anus and menses” [*wa ittaqi al-dubura wa al-hīda*] from the narration because it proves that this narration doesn’t allow sodomy with women.
5. Blatantly lie that the Urdu translator did not translate parts of the narration to save themselves from criticism.

6. Falsely claim that this narration propagates the belief in the distortion of the Holy Qur'ān, in order to find an excuse to falsely accuse the translator of dishonesty.

These are the clear examples of how reliable and trustworthy Answering-Ansar is with their claims and quotations.

Did Anyone Benefit from this Propaganda?

It should be known that this subchapter, along with its lies, has not only shown disrespect to the early and late Muslims, but also gave another excuse to the Christian Missionaries to attack our beloved Prophet, Muhammad (saws). Among them is the discourteous critic of Islam, Sam Shamoun, who has used this twaddle of lies by the Answering-Ansar team to claim that Prophet Muhammad (saws) degraded women.

He states in one of his works entitled *'Women in Islam'*:

“Finally, here is a narration from al-Tirmidhi regarding Muhammad permitting Umar to engage in anal sex with his wives:

“Ibn Abbas narrates that Hadhrath Umar went before the Messenger of God and said, ‘Master I am destroyed!’ The Messenger of God asked, ‘What thing has destroyed you?’ Umar replied, ‘Last night I had anal sex.’ The Messenger of God did not give a reply to Umar, then Allāh sent down this revelation, ‘Your wives are as a tilth unto you; so approach your tilth when or how ye will; the words "kabool wa Dhabar" (the anus is accepted).’”
(Jami Al-Tirmidhi, Bab al-Tafseer, Volume 2, p. 382, Ayat Hars)

To read the original Arabic text of this hadith please go [here](#).”

- http://www.answering-islam.org/Shamoun/women_in_islam2.htm

Can the Answering-Ansar team inform their readers of who is responsible for this insult of our beloved Prophet (saws) that is based on mistranslation and distortion of a narration?

A Bit from the Overflowing Knowledge

In the end, the following few points should also be noted about this subchapter so the reader could know a little more about the knowledgeable pillars behind the Answering-Ansar project:

- There is no “Bab al-Tafseer” in *Sunan* of al-Tirmidhī. It is *Abwāb Tafsīr al-Qur’ān*.
- The third reference provided by the Answering-Ansar team for the narration is “Gharab al Quran” while the title of the actual book is *Gharā’ib al-Qur’ān*.

- The next one, states “Tafseer al Ibn Katheer” which is linguistically incorrect. It should be *Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr* as “ibn” here is a possessive noun, and a possessive noun can never have “al” before it. A rule learnt in the beginning stages of Arabic study.
- The fifth reference is “Fayl ai Lawathar” while the title of the book is *Nayl al-Awṭār*.
- They mention that their lies are proven from “the Saha Sittah.” The actual word is *Ṣiḥāḥ* not “Saha.”

May Allāh save all of us from ignorance and dishonesty.
Or as it is in Answering-Ansar’s case, from the mixture of both.

It is only Allah (swt) who gives success, and blessings and peace be upon the Seal
of the Prophets, his Pure Progeny and his Noble Companions



Works Cited

Shī`ī texts:

1. *al-Kaḥfī*
Abu Ja`far al-Kulayni (d. 329)
Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiyya
Tehran, Iran
2. *Mir`āt al-`Uqūl fī Sharḥ Akhbār Āl al-Rasūl*
Muḥammad Bāqir al-Majlisī (d. 1110)
Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiyya
Tehran, Iran
3. *Mishkāt al-Anwār fī Ghurar al-Akḥbār*
Abū al-Faḍl al-Ṭabarsī (d. 7th)
Dar al-Hadith
Qum, Iran

Sunnī texts:

4. *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*
Abū `Abd al-Raḥmān al-Nasā`ī (d. 303)
Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya
Beirut, Lebanon
5. *Jā`izat al-Sha`ūdhi Tarjuma Jāmi` al-Tirmidhī (Urdu)*
Badī` al-Zamān
Muhammad Ali Karkhana
Karachi, Pakistan
6. *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān bi Tartīb Ibn Balbān*
Ibn Ḥibbān (d. 354)
Mu`assasat al-Risala
Beirut, Lebanon
7. *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*
Abū `Isā al-Tirmidhī (d. 279)
Dar al-Fikr
Beirut, Lebanon
8. *al-Jāmi` al-Kabīr [Sunan al-Tirmidhī]*
Abū `Isā al-Tirmidhī (d. 279)
Dar al-Gharb al-Islami
Beirut, Lebanon
9. *Tafsīr Ibn Abī Ḥātim*
Ibn Abī Ḥātim (d. 327)
al-Maktabat al-`Asriyya
Sidon, Lebanon

Other:

10. *A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic*
Hans Wehr
Librairie Du Liban
Beirut, Lebanon